Proceedings of the 20th International Seminar of the ISME
Music in School and Teacher Education Commission (MISTEC)

Federal University of Paraná and School of Music and Fine Arts of Paraná
Curitiba, Brazil

14-18 July 2014

Editors
Gabriel Rusinek & Eva Sæther

©International Society for Music Education 2014
www.isme.org
National Library of Australia Cataloguing-in-Publication

Author: ISME Music in School and Teacher Education Commission (MISTEC)

Title: Proceedings of the 20th International Seminar of the Music in School and Teacher Education International Seminar, Curitiba, Brazil [electronic resource]

ISBN: 978-0-9942055-5-1 (ebook)
Notes: Includes bibliographical references.
Subjects: Music--Congresses.
Music in education--Congresses.
Music instruction and study--Congresses.
Music teacher education -- Congresses.
Music and creativity -- Congresses.

ISME Music in School and Teacher Education Commission (MISTEC)
Dewey Number: 780.7

Proceedings of the MISTEC 20th International Seminar
MISTEC Mission

The ISME Music in Schools and Teacher Education Commission held its first seminar in 1976. MISTEC believes that music should be made available to all students in all schools and at all levels by professional music educators. The Commission further supports the premise that teacher education programmes should aim to produce highly qualified future music teachers and support their continuous professional development. MISTEC believes in its international role as a body for promoting theoretical and practical innovation, research methodologies and policy development to meet the challenges faced by music educators worldwide.

The mission of MISTEC is to promote and support:
- the development of research expertise in the field of music teacher education, including the creation of new methodologies;
- the development of theoretical innovation and new practical approaches for music teacher education;
- international collaboration between professionals from different parts of the world, including the setting up of joint research projects between different institutions;
- the exchange of multicultural resources and innovative teaching approaches between ISME members who work in higher education;
- policy discussion aiming to share experiences between professionals and institutions from around the world; and
- colleagues around the world to influence the formation of educational policies so as to ensure that there will be quality music education for all children.

MISTEC Commissioners 2012-2014

- Emily Achieng’ Akuno (Kenya), Chair
- Julie Ballantyne (Australia)
- Smaragda Chrysostomou (Greece)
- Gabriel Rusinek (Spain)
- Eva Sæther (Sweden)
- Paulina Wai Ying Wong (Hong Kong)
The ISME Music in Schools and Teacher Education Commission expresses its sincere appreciation to the following people and organizations for their support and sponsorship:

Rosane Cardoso de Araujo  
Seminar Host  
UFPR- Federal University of Paraná

Margaret Amaral de Andrade  
Seminar Host  
Embap/UNESPAR-School of Music and Fine Arts of Paraná

Sarah Hennessy  
ISME Board Liaison  
University of Exeter

All papers were peer reviewed by the MISTEC commissioners:  
Emily Achieng’ Akuno, The Kenya Polytechnic University College, Nairobi, Kenya  
Eva Saether, Malmo Academy of Music, Lund University, Sweden  
Gabriel Rusinek, Complutense University of Madrid, Spain  
Paulina Wai-Ying Wong, Hong Kong Institute of Education, Hong Kong/China  
Julie Ballantyne, School of Music, University of Queensland, Australia  
Smaragda Chrysostymou, The Faculty for Music Studies, University of Athens, Greece
Socio-cultural contexts of the musician-teacher’s professional identity development

Javier Duque Gutiérrez
Escola Superior de Música de Catalunya (Spain)

Mª Cecilia Jorquera Jaramillo
University of Seville (Spain)

The interrelation between professional identity, instructional conceptions and socio-cultural contexts in teachers’ lives is explored. Harmonic correspondence between teachers’ professional identity and her working and professional activity in music education is necessary in order to develop good educational practices. This relation is affected by different kinds of socio-cultural contexts, as family, school, initial professional education, and the entrance into the professional and working field. Construction of conceptions on their own teaching action develops in relation to those contexts, and they configure at the same time the way how the teacher tells her narrative on herself as a professional in music education, that is, her professional identity. This research bases on the complexity paradigm, and assumes a qualitative methodology involving 16 biographical in-depth interviews. The selected sample is intentionally heterogeneous in terms of contexts, identities and conceptions. Results show that contexts introduce differences in teachers’ instructional conceptions corresponding to nuances in the types of identity; but they are not relevant and do not transform professional identity, which appears to be the own re-elaboration of each teacher, some times going with and some others against the context teachers are experiencing.

Keywords: music teacher education, music performing professional identity, musician-teacher professional identity, socio-cultural contexts, music teacher’s biographical narratives.

Introduction

Comprehending and constructing teachers’ professional identity is becoming a determining aspect in educational change and improvement. Processes of initial teachers’ education and professional development, along the XX century, have been considered as central factors in promoting transformations into educational practice. So they have received great attention from researchers and many available resources in educational and accreditation systems have devoted to them. Nevertheless, at the beginning of the XXI century, it appears to be proved that the importance of these factors diminishes or they are less effective when the transformation promoted in teachers does not affect their professional identity in a harmonic and determining way, or when there is no consistent relation between their professional identity and their education or professional development (Enyedy, Goldberg & Muir, 2005; Day et al., 2006; Roberts, 2007; Beth & Sharma, 2008).

Goals of the present study

Professional identity has been described basing on a set of factors (Zembylas, 2005; Bolívar 2006; Darby 2008; Monereo et al., 2009) among which teachers’ representations on following points should be highlighted (Monereo & Pozo, 2011): a) Their own roles connected to practice contexts, and b) their explicit or implicit conceptions on teaching and learning.

This research aims at exploring these representations, and focusing on how they relate to the construction of professional identity when promoting and facilitating processes of change and improvement. In relation to the former objective we will search for the significance/importance of the cultural socialisation context in family, school, institutional and labour/professional context in constructing the professional identity of the musician-
teacher, and how teachers elaborate ideas, conceptions and instructional models on
classroom action.

**Theoretical framework**

At least from the 1980s, the divergence between educational and professional
development processes, and the identity as a music teacher requested by daily professional
practice, in the field of music education, is quite well-known.

**Professional identity**

Dubar (2000) denies the possible definition or existence of *essentialist* identities *a
priori* that, *a posteriori*, should be verified in social reality. Every identity is a social and
linguistic construction related to a historical moment and a social context that is sometimes
considered timeless. Similarly, Ricoeur (1995/1996) solves the historical dilemma between
identity as an essence that remains and as a constantly changing aspect of reality, by
accepting the self-biographical narrative as the *identity* of the ego, that is, identity –
personal or social – is constantly changing and being reinterpreted while it maintains its
unity and coherence because the story told requires it. Therefore, the approach of substance
or essence previous to experience has been discarded in present studies on identity, and
self-biographical narrative as symbolic construction is the person’s identity at a certain
time.

Departing from here, it is necessary to define how symbols and meanings will
contribute to the story in order to *construct* the narrated identity. Two key-processes are
highlighted (Lipiansky *et al.*, 1990; Demazière & Dubar, 1997), following Bolívar (2006,
p. 40): a) The narrative of the person herself: it is the *identity to oneself* or self-
comprehension constructed by means of the representations of the narratives or stories
previous to the present moment. b) The narrative of others: it is the *identity for others*, and
it involves the representations one constructs basing on representations delivered by
persons of the environment by means of social relations.

The teacher’s professional identity is an *elaboration of the person on herself* that is
partly the personal identity constructed basing on the *ego* as a teacher, and partly the
social identity constructed basing on *us* as professional practitioners in teaching, including
in *us* the differentiation towards *them*, configuring the identity of the different professional
social groups, as well as their possible internal professional group differentiation. The
teacher’s professional identity results from the teacher’s representations on her profession
and on the activities and practices associated to it in professional contexts (Blin, 1997):
teachers construct their representations’ network of particular elements on the profession
and its practice. The representations the teacher has on herself as a person, as well as those
on teachers and the teaching profession, converge into her professional identity (Gohier,
2001).

Among music professions it is well-known that professionals of a specific one do not
necessarily match up with other music professionals’ perceptions on their environment and
professional practice. Specifically, performers’ perceptions and beliefs cannot be
transferred to those of who decide to devote themselves to teaching: they live quite
different experiences, and they interpret them in different manners (Burland & Davidson,
2002). By means of statistical proximity or distance to a referent or model of professional
reflecting pedagogical knowledge from the XXI century, differences have been verified in other contexts (Duque & Jorquera, 2014).

Kadushin’s (1969) pioneering studies show musicians denying music teaching and supporting performing as the desired means to earn life. L’Roy (1983) confirms that music teacher-students’ professional identity is mainly defined by professional performers’ norms, despite their pedagogical education. Roberts’ (1991a, 1991b, 1993) large studies still significantly show a very low internalization of the educational world among music education students, despite the fact that this is their prospective labour and profession.

**Professional identity and instructional models**

An aspect of professional identity that has consequences in classroom action lies in teachers’ conceptions that take form as instructional models with specific and peculiar features to the discipline (Jorquera, 2008, 2010b). Considering that school knowledge results from *sociogenesis* (Goodson, 1991, 1995; Cuesta Fernández, 1998; Viñao Frago, 1982), a fundamental component of instructional models are conceptions on subject matter, (Jorquera, 2010a). In music have been identified, deriving from the traditional model, the *academic model*, descending from the university music teaching tradition; the *practical model*, resulting from music teaching in conservatoires; the *communicative-recreational model*, more recent, generated from indirect influence of the educational trends, and other characteristic circumstances of a great part of music teaching along the XX century; and the *complex model*, assimilating many elements of the aforementioned models and includes more complex and systemic positions of music teaching (Jorquera, 2008, 2010b).

Instructional models emerge from teachers’ conceptions elaborated on teaching, learning, their teaching goals, how they think students’ ideas and interests should be involved in classroom activities, how should learning be evaluated, how the social context relates to school and the classroom; here the subject matter is central, turning the instructional model coherent regarding the knowledge taught.

**Contexts of primary socialisation: family and school**

The music student’s first teachers and family (Ellis, 1999) instil the feeling of failure as a musician if she does not achieve to success as a solo performer. The fact of not being capable to talk to adults about this issue in case of disagreement could be a source of conflict along the whole life of the prospective musician.

Regarding the socialisation as a musician-teacher, when finishing secondary education, around the age of 18, students have already experienced at least 12 years learning and observing what it is to be a teacher (Lortie, 1975). It is well-known that this primary socialisation phase is crucial for the prospective music teacher (Woodford, 2002), and it is much more significant than for teachers of other subjects – literature, chemistry, mathematics, other arts, etc. – (Beynon, 1998; Cox, 1997; Duling, 2000; L’Roy, 1983; Roberts, 2000). The key question consists in finding out how the influence of primary socialisation leads towards one or another music profession. It has been showed that music teachers of students 6 to 18 years guide them towards the performing profession before any other option, including the music teacher profession (Cox, 1997; Beynon, 1998; Froehlich & L’Roy, 1985; L’Roy, 1983; Roberts, 1991; Roberts, 2000). Considering these studies, the conclusion is that this is the most powerful professional acculturation along this period,
and it is what all music students go through, whatever their intention regarding further education may be.

**Contexts of secondary socialisation: initial education**

Literature shows a gap between musicians’ initial education and the working opportunities they will face. In Denmark (Kósa, 1998: 98) schools of music claimed for more pedagogical training – and less centred on the classical canon – in higher education; in Germany, Niessen (1995) confirmed the need for a more pedagogical ethos (identity) in qualified musicians; and in UK some institutions, like the Higher Educational Funding Council for England, became visible (Bennett & Stanberg, 2006) when they asked initial education to relate to work opportunities only as performers that actually do not correspond to reality, where musicians have many different jobs (Bennett, 2004; Gregory, 2002; Rogers, 2002).

Identification with the role of performing musicians becomes more powerful during higher education, so that students’ disorientation regarding what they are expected to do in professional life becomes enormous (Poklemba, 1995). When music education students get to higher education – that is to secondary socialisation – (Berger & Luckmann, 1968), they already have experienced primary socialisation: they possess and show strong beliefs on what they wish to be and what they want to teach as music education professionals. This is a result of re-elaborating the influence exerted by persons and events occurred during their youth (Beynon, 1998; Cox, 1997; Duling, 2000; Gillespie & Hamann, 1999; L’Roy, 1983; Mark, 1998; Prescesky, 1997; Roberts, 1991b). As a consequence, it will not be an easy process but rather a sort of crash against the identity as a professional in teaching promoted by the educational institution. During the students’ higher education in music education they could maintain their identity as performers over the identity as musician-teachers (Beynon, 1998; Froehlich & L’Roy, 1985; L’Roy, 1983; Roberts, 1991b).

**Working context**

When entering into the labour market the inadequacy of education compared to the working demand leads to high stress levels (Mark, 1998:13), and questioning the education received causes insecurity in carrying out their work (Kelchtermans & Ballet, 2002: 105). This situation, when maintained steadily during the first years of music teaching, could produce a practice shock (Mark, 1998), especially when the musician-teacher starts her career as a teacher. In the end, the inadequacy in teachers’ training is a main factor of burnout among music teachers (Leong, 1996; Kelly, 1999).

Research says that music teaching professionals who possess pedagogical education generally evaluate their work in positive terms. Bailer’s (1997) study on general music teachers in Austria shows that satisfaction related to their working position regards – the most important at the beginning – the fact of having the chance to be in contact and working with students; planning and carrying out extracurricular music activities; organising musical events with students; daily music education activity in classrooms. When deciding again if they would be music education professionals carrying out the same work they already know, 26% said yes; 42% said possibly yes; 23% said they do not know; 9% said no.
Methodological issues

The complexity paradigm developed from Morin’s (1994) main contribution is assumed (Ameijde & Murga, 2000). The epistemological features posed are interdependence between subject and object; chance as an available element and as knowledge itself; contradiction to logic and the dialogical principle that nullifies opposite logic positions; recursive or reversible principle regarding cause and effect; hologrammatic conception that implies the whole and the part at the same time; and the principle of uncertainty that denies prediction as a certain and valid knowledge (De la Herrán, 2005, p. 475).

In the present study complexity allows us to work, for example, simultaneously from the standpoint of symbolic interactionism, using qualitative tools to gather the representations configuring identity, and using referents and teacher professional identity models capable of being generalised and validated by means of statistical measurements.

Data gathering

The sample is an intentional or theoretical sample (Glaser & Strauss, 1967), based on analytical induction (Znaniecki, 1934) and contextualised in saturation criterion. This way, the sample was chosen in order to show its sensitivity to a great diversity of contexts to verify how they relate to identity and instructional conceptions: urban as well as rural case samples have been selected, with music education based on oral tradition as well as the most formal academic training, with teaching professional activity within the general educational system as well as in music schools, and in conservatories, or fully devoted to her doctoral studies in music education. Finally, the general socio-cultural contrast has been treated in selecting cases from the South-American Spanish-speaking area (2 teachers from Colombia, 4 from Chile), and from Europe in Spain (2 primary Spanish-speaking teachers in Seville, and 8 Catalan-speaking teachers in Tarragona and Barcelona).

Data were gathered in 16 biographical semi-structured in-depth interviews. The script used goes through a chronological review of the socio-cultural contexts and emphasises the experiences, ideas, conceptions and emotions each person remembers on music and on music teaching in each setting or context of his/her life. The interviews were video and audio-recorded, and after being transcribed, they were analysed using emerging categories finally inscribed into the four root categories or containers related to the four main contexts taken into account. Comparing and cross-checking of all the cases, based on this categorisation of the interviews’ content, shows new information that allows drawing an interpretation and conclusions.

Data analysis

All the interviewees are active in performing and teaching.

Regarding family contexts we found clear model referents for the performer and for the musician teacher, sometimes supporting, stimulating and helping to afford music studies, and some others, without support. Contexts with no referents were found too, accessing to music by chance.

Regarding school contexts, some of them were specialised in music (music schools, conservatories, schools with special music curriculum) and in others music was one more subject in the general curriculum, as an ancillary subject. When school contexts are
specialised in music and have conservative features, the performer profiles do not question the education received, while the teacher profiles do question it.

In initial education contexts we should distinguish between music and education. Regarding music, we found education in conservatoires and universities. In some cases education in music takes place simultaneously to pedagogical education, as it happens to be in Latin-American cases.

When labour/professional contexts are rich, a musician-teacher identity may develop. When context is unfavourable and offers poor pedagogical stimuli, musician-teacher identity could be hindered or even not develop. Musicians, who teach and do not develop as teachers, usually do not consider the possibility of receiving education for teaching, while they look for opportunities of continuing education in performing.

**Conclusions and implications for music education**

The existence of a performer and a teacher identity has been confirmed. Differently from what was found in former research consisting of 3 identities (PP, performer–performer; PT, performer–teacher; TT, teacher–teacher, Duque & Jorquera, 2014), it appears to be more functional speaking of a varied typology of identities between two extreme poles. They could be represented on a continuum with at least the following nuances: PPP (performer–performer–performer), PPT (performer–performer–teacher), PTT (performer–teacher–teacher), TTT (teacher–teacher–teacher).

The different identity degrees relate to the teachers’ declared instructional models, with correspondence between identities with strong performer components and the academic and the practical instructional models. The identities where the musician-teacher profile prevails, tend to the communicative-recreational and the complex instructional models.

These identities and the instructional models, as a consequence, have two conditioning sources: personal elaboration and the contexts’ influence as agents of change.

Family contexts have the same role when encouraging performer’s or teacher’s career: they both have referents for each one’s identity, being critical points of departure in order to comprehend what they have become. These referents are experienced as stimuli to develop an inclination toward the future professional activity as a performer or as a teacher. When there are no referents, that is when performing or teaching appear by chance, performer or teacher profile may develop. The fact that common structural factors have been found, but with different content, supports the idea that they are two autonomous profiles, with no subordination to each other.

Regarding school contexts, literature does not specify their effects, indicating that any school context specialised in music socialises in just one direction, that is, performing, and does not mention the ‘negative socialisation’, consisting of reaffirming rejection toward school context being lived and towards the kind of music education being received. In the future, this will tip the scales towards a critical attitude and searching for a professional field related to music education.

Regarding initial education contexts, performer profiles choose studies related to performance, as literature already showed (Froehlich, 2007). Performer identity consolidation appears to be independent to the existence or not of an academic context, even if it assumes and adopts its typical referents, as the cases of performers of oral tradition show. Those contexts who allow an activity with socio-cultural impact possibly
provide pedagogical nuances to the performer’s professional identity, determining positions of social compromise in the cases of Latin America.

When the moment of initial education comes, those persons who still have not defined their professional choice or those who already have a defined educator profile, usually select studies related to music teaching. There are also cases of performing studies because of the complete lack of awareness, experiences or orientation to educational studies. These persons discover education later, in labour/professional context. When initial education takes place late, it has the role of continuing education. We observed that the teacher’s identity develops and becomes steady later than the performer’s identity. Contexts may not be determining for the musician-teacher’s identity, except for maybe those who arrive to work having not yet crystallised their identity, so that professional practice finally reveals or confirms their teacher identity. Development phases are analogous in both types of identity, whatever the context may be, but it is clear that the musician-teacher’s identity goes against the stream of the contexts s/he may face for a long time. As a consequence, identity crystallises later.

It also appears to be clear that the contexts’ influence is independent regarding the gender variable.

References


Cox, P. (1997). The professional socialization of music teachers as musicians and


St. John’s: Memorial University of Newfoundland.