

1           **MODELLING GROWTH AND CO<sub>2</sub> FIXATION BY SCENEDESMUS**

2                           **VACUOLATUS IN CONTINUOUS CULTURE**

3   *Rafael García-Cubero*<sup>\*a</sup>, *José Moreno-Fernández*<sup>a</sup>, *Mercedes García-González*<sup>a</sup>

4   <sup>a</sup> *Instituto de Bioquímica Vegetal y Fotosíntesis. Isla de La Cartuja. CSIC-Universidad de*  
5 *Sevilla. Av. Americo Vespucio 49. CP. 41092. Seville. Spain*

6   <sup>\*</sup> *Corresponding author: Rafael-García-Cubero. E-mail. rafael.cubero@wur.nl*

7  
8   **1. HIGHLIGHTS**

- 9       • A screening of eight species of microalgae and cyanobacteria in continuous culture  
10       was performed
- 11       • *Scenedesmus vacuolatus* was selected for modelling its growth and CO<sub>2</sub> fixation
- 12       • The potential of this microalga for carbon abatement was tested using simulated flue  
13       gas as the source of CO<sub>2</sub>.

14   **2. ABSTRACT**

15   A promising approach to CO<sub>2</sub> abatement is the use of photosynthetic microorganisms.  
16   Different microalgae (*Chlorococum* sp., *Porphyridium purpureum*, *Scenedesmus*  
17 *vacuolatus*) and cyanobacteria (*Anabaena* PCC7119, *Anabaena* PCC7120, *Anabaena* PCC  
18 7937, *Nostoc* PCC 9202, *Nostoc punctiforme*) were cultivated in photobioreactors operated  
19   as chemostat, simulating light conditions analogous to those prevailing outdoors and  
20   compared on their ability to fix CO<sub>2</sub> efficiently. Due to its high biomass productivity and  
21   CO<sub>2</sub> fixation rate, *Scenedesmus vacuolatus* was selected and the effect of different culture  
22   parameters (i.e. dilution rate, temperature, pH and impinging irradiance on surface's

23 photobioreactor) on its biomass productivity and CO<sub>2</sub> fixation was further investigated. In  
24 optimal culture conditions, *S.vacuolatus* rendered 0.63 g biomass L<sup>-1</sup> d<sup>-1</sup>, resulting 1.15  
25 gCO<sub>2</sub> assimilated L<sup>-1</sup> d<sup>-1</sup>. Based on the data obtained in this study, a mathematical model  
26 was developed to describe growth and CO<sub>2</sub> bio-fixation by *S.vacuolatus*. Finally, the  
27 potential of this microalga for carbon capture was further tested using synthetic flue gases  
28 as the source of CO<sub>2</sub>.

### 29 3. INTRODUCTION

30 Carbon dioxide has been regarded as one of the most important greenhouse gases.  
31 Anthropogenic CO<sub>2</sub> emissions contribute significantly to global warming [1]. The amount  
32 of CO<sub>2</sub> in the atmosphere was 390.9 ppm in 2011, increasing on average 2 ppm/year for  
33 the past 10 years and reaching 140% of the pre-industrial level (280 ppm) (WMO 2012).  
34 According to Chiu et al (2008) [2], 2.6×10<sup>10</sup> CO<sub>2</sub> tons will be released into the atmosphere  
35 in the year 2100. Flue gases from power plants are mostly responsible for these global  
36 CO<sub>2</sub> emissions in the world [3].

37 CO<sub>2</sub> fixation using terrestrial plants and photosynthetic microorganisms represents a  
38 sustainable approach to transform CO<sub>2</sub> into organic matter [4] and [5]. Plant contribution to  
39 CO<sub>2</sub> capture has been estimated to account for only 3-6% of emissions [6]. Microalgae and  
40 cyanobacteria have received much attention because of their wide distribution, high  
41 biomass productivity, fast CO<sub>2</sub> uptake and utilization [7]. They can grow on a simple  
42 culture medium containing inorganic salts, tolerate adverse climate conditions and do not  
43 compete with agriculture for arable land [8]. Furthermore, microalgal biomass accumulates  
44 significant amounts of lipids, carbohydrates, proteins and other valuable compounds, such  
45 as pigments and vitamins, which can be used as active ingredients in pharmacy, food

46 additives, feed supplements and biofuels production (biodiesel, bioethanol, biohydrogen or  
47 biomethane) [9], [10] and [11].

48 The selection of suitable microalgal strains for CO<sub>2</sub> bio-mitigation has significant effect on  
49 efficiency, costs and competitiveness of the process. The desirable traits include: high  
50 growth and CO<sub>2</sub> utilization rates, tolerance to trace components of flue gases, such as SO<sub>x</sub>  
51 and NO<sub>x</sub>, valuable compounds as biomass constituents, easiness of harvesting, wide  
52 tolerance to pH and temperature variations [12]. Most common microalgae and  
53 cyanobacteria species used for CO<sub>2</sub> mitigation include *Botryococcus braunii* [13],  
54 *Chlorella vulgaris* [14], *Chlorella kessleri* [15], *Chlorococcum littorale* [16], *Scenedesmus*  
55 *sp* [17], *Chlamydomonas reinhardtii* [18] and *Spirulina sp* [19].

56 In the present study, a screening for CO<sub>2</sub> abatement of eight cyanobacteria and microalgae  
57 species was performed in continuous culture conditions. The latter offer many advantages  
58 over the batch mode for assessing real biomass productivity and CO<sub>2</sub> fixation [20]. Among  
59 the tested species, *S. vacuolatus* was selected as the most promising microorganism for CO<sub>2</sub>  
60 removal. An analysis of the influence of different values of irradiance, pH, temperature and  
61 dilution rate was performed and its growth and CO<sub>2</sub> assimilation was described through  
62 mathematical modellings as function of the aforementioned parameters. Furthermore, *S.*  
63 *vacuolatus* was cultivated using a gas mixture of analogous composition to that of the flue  
64 gas from a power plant demonstrating the feasibility of this specie to be used in flue gas  
65 bioremediation process.

#### 66 4. MATERIALS AND METHODS

- 67 • **Microorganisms and culture conditions**

68 The microalgae and cyanobacteria studied in this work were selected upon a literature  
69 survey based on their growth rate: *Chlorococcum* sp [21], *Porphyridium purpureum* [22],  
70 *Scenedesmus vacuolatus* [23], *Anabaena* PCC7119 [24], *Anabaena* PCC7120 [25],  
71 *Anabaena* PCC7937 [26], *Nostoc* PCC9202 [27], *Nostoc punctiforme* [28].  
72 *Chlorococcum* sp. and *Scenedesmus vacuolatus* were grown photo-autotrophically on the  
73 medium described by Arnon [29], supplied with NaNO<sub>3</sub> as to reach 20 mM. *Porphyridium*  
74 *purpureum* was grown on f/2 medium [30]. *Anabaena* and *Nostoc* species were grown  
75 under diazotrophic conditions in BG<sub>11</sub> medium [31].  
76 Continuous cultivations were performed in 2.0 L capacity in a jacketed sterilized bubble  
77 column photo-bioreactor (0.07 m diameter, 0.50 m height), containing 1.8 L of cell  
78 suspension, continuously sparged with air (33 L (L culture<sup>-1</sup>) h<sup>-1</sup>). Temperature was  
79 maintained at 25 or 30° C for microalgae and cyanobacteria, respectively, and pH at 7.5 or  
80 8 for microalgae and cyanobacteria, respectively by injection on demand of CO<sub>2</sub> into the  
81 air stream. The photo-bioreactor was illuminated by using six Phillips PL-32 W/840/4p  
82 white-light lamps. Light intensity followed a sine cycle of 12 h light/12 h dark, providing  
83 3000 μE m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> as maximal incident irradiance on the photo-bioreactor' surface. Initially,  
84 the photo-bioreactors were inoculated with batch-grown cells and operated on batch mode  
85 until stationary phase was attained. Then, it was switched to operate on continuous mode;  
86 fresh medium was continuously fed during the light period (12 hours) at a flow rate of 45  
87 mL h<sup>-1</sup> or 90 mL h<sup>-1</sup> (dilution rate, D; 0.26 d<sup>-1</sup> or 0.66 d<sup>-1</sup>) for microalgae and  
88 cyanobacteria, respectively with withdrawal of culture at the same rate. Once steady state  
89 was achieved, analytical determinations were performed. It was assumed that cultures  
90 achieved a steady state ( $\mu=D$ ) after harvesting 5 times the volume of the reactor (10L)

91 followed by 4-8 constant determinations of dry weight. All experiments were done in  
92 triplicate.

93 • **Analytical procedures**

94 Biomass was harvested by centrifugation for 10 min 1500xg, lyophilized and stored at -  
95 20°C for future analysis. All the analytical measurements were made in triplicate.

96 Microalgae biomass concentration was determined simultaneously by dry weight (DW)  
97 measurement and by total organic carbon (TOC) concentration in culture samples [32]. For  
98 DW measures, aliquots of the culture suspensions were filtered through pre-weighted glass  
99 microfiber filters (Whatman, 0.45 µm pore diameter). Filters were washed up with a  
100 solution of ammonium formate (1%) in order to remove all the salts. The filters containing  
101 the washed cells were dried in an oven (80° C; 24h) before weighed on a precision scale.  
102 Biomass was determined by the difference between the weights of pre-weighted filters and  
103 those containing the dried cells. For biomass determinations based on TOC, part of the  
104 volume of the culture sample was centrifuged (1500g; 10min) in order to discriminate the  
105 carbon present in the excreted compounds. Thus, the concentration of the total organic  
106 carbon in the culture sample (the remaining part not centrifuged or broth) and in the  
107 supernatant was determined by the use of a TOC analyzer (Shimadzu V-CPH). The organic  
108 carbon in the biomass was calculated according to Equation 2. TOC-estimated biomass was  
109 determined according to the percentage of carbon present in the biomass determined  
110 previously by an elemental analyzer (CHNS-O THERMO, FLASH-EA 1112, Series) and  
111 the TOC concentration already measured in the biomass (Equation 3), The amount of fixed  
112 CO<sub>2</sub> was calculated from TOC values, taking into account that one gram of total organic  
113 carbon corresponds to 3.66 g of fixed CO<sub>2</sub> [32]. Protein content was measured using the

114 Lowry method [33]. The lipid content was determined as described by Kochert [34]. The  
115 carbohydrate content was measured using the Dubois method [35]. The calorific value of  
116 lyophilized biomass (20mg) was measured in a Compensated Jacket Calorimeter Parr 6100  
117 (Parr Instrument Company).

118 • **Measurements and calculations of Irradiance**

- 119 a) Maximum incident PAR Irradiance,  $I_{\max}$  ( $\mu\text{E m}^{-2} \text{s}^{-1}$ ): The measurement of  
120 photosynthetically active irradiance (PAR) directly emitted by the lamps was carried  
121 out using a  $4\pi$  quantum scalar irradiance sensor QSL-100 (Biospherical Instrument, San  
122 Diego, CA), inside the photo-bioreactor (without cells).
- 123 b) Average PAR irradiance,  $I_{\text{av}}$  ( $\mu\text{E m}^{-2} \text{s}^{-1}$ ) defines the actual PAR irradiance available  
124 for each cell inside the broth once a steady state is achieved (that means the remaining  
125 light available after reflection by diffusion and shading). Thus, average PAR irradiance  
126 was calculated as a function of  $I_{\max}$ , the light path ( $p$ ), the biomass concentration ( $C_b$ )  
127 and the extinction coefficient of the biomass ( $K_a$ ) as described by Molina-Grima [36]:

128 
$$I_{\text{av}} = \frac{I_{\max}}{p \times C_b \times K_a} (1 - e^{(-p \times C_b \times K_a)}) \quad (\text{Eq. 1})$$

129 Where  $I_{\max}$  was different according to the light intensity used in each experiment (3000/2;  
130 2000/2 or 1000/2  $\mu\text{E m}^{-2} \text{s}^{-1}$ ), light path ( $p$ ) of the photo-bioreactor was 0.07 m,  $C_b$  was the  
131 biomass concentration in each steady state, and the extinction coefficient ( $K_a$ ) calculated  
132 experimentally for *Scenedesmus vacuolatus* was  $0.17 \text{ m}^2 \text{ g}^{-1}$ .

133 • **Numerical methods**

134 The organic carbon in the biomass was determined according to eq. 2:

135  $C_{\text{organic biomass}} (\text{g L}^{-1}) = \text{TOC}_{\text{culture}} (\text{g L}^{-1}) - \text{TOC}_{\text{supernatant}} (\text{g L}^{-1})$  (Eq. 2)

136 Biomass (TOC-estimated) concentration was determined according to eq. 3:

137  $\text{Biomass concentration} (\text{g L}^{-1}) = C_{\text{organic biomass}} (\text{g L}^{-1}) \times \% C_{\text{elemental analysis}}$  (Eq. 3)

138 Biomass productivity (once a steady state was achieved) was calculated according to eq. 4:

139  $\text{Biomass productivity} (\text{g L}^{-1} \text{d}^{-1}) = \text{Biomass concentration} (\text{g L}^{-1}) \times \text{dilution rate} (\text{d}^{-1})$  (Eq.4)

140  $\text{CO}_2$  fixation rate was calculated according to eq. 5:

141  $\text{CO}_2 \text{ fixation rate} (\text{g L}^{-1} \text{d}^{-1}) = \Delta C_{\text{organic biomass}} (\text{g L}^{-1} \text{d}^{-1}) \times \frac{44}{12}$  (Eq.5)

142 • **Synthetic flue gases**

143 The composition of the synthetic flue gases used to simulate an exhausted stream of a  
144 450MW power plant is described as follows: 12% (v/v)  $\text{CO}_2$ , 0.06% (v/v)  $\text{SO}_2$ , 0.08%  
145 (v/v)  $\text{NO}_2$ , 5% (v/v)  $\text{O}_2$  and the rest  $\text{N}_2$ .

146 • **Modelling growth and  $\text{CO}_2$  fixation by *S. vacuolatus***

147 In order to formulate a mathematical model for growth and  $\text{CO}_2$  fixation by *S. vacuolatus*,  
148 a single-parameter optimization approach was used. Thus, different culture variables (i.e.  
149 pH, temperature, dilution rate and light) were performed and studied their influence on the  
150 yield of *S. vacuolatus* cultures. Sequentially, each optimal value for growth and  $\text{CO}_2$   
151 fixation of each variable was set as a constant in the successive experiments, creating a  
152 matrix of data that allowed developing a model that describes growth and  $\text{CO}_2$   
153 assimilation.

154 • **Statistical analysis**

155 Statistical analysis of data, variance (ANOVA factorial) and correlation between  
156 parameters was performed using the 7.0 version of Statgraphics software.

## 157 5. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

### 158 • Microalgae and cyanobacteria selection in continuous conditions

159 Biomass productivity and CO<sub>2</sub> assimilation capability in continuous regime was evaluated  
160 for the different microalgae and cyanobacteria preselected.

161 In the cultures condition used in this work, the highest CO<sub>2</sub> fixation rates were recorded for  
162 *S. vacuolatus* and *N. punctiforme* (0.88 and 0.86 g CO<sub>2</sub> L<sup>-1</sup> d<sup>-1</sup> respectively) (Table 1). In  
163 this selection, a well-known species used for CO<sub>2</sub> mitigation as *Anabaena* showed also  
164 noteworthy CO<sub>2</sub> fixation values but lower than the two above-mentioned species.  
165 Nevertheless, our results for *Anabaena* are higher than others reported in literature by  
166 Clares et al. [32] for *Anabaena* sp. ATCC 33047, *P. purpureum*, *Anabaena* PCC7119 or  
167 *Anabaena* PCC7120 cultures were not able to achieve a steady state in the operational  
168 conditions performed and discarded for the final selection.

169 Although the main scope of this initial screening was to test the CO<sub>2</sub> assimilation capability  
170 of the different species, it is important to couple the CO<sub>2</sub> abatement to the production of  
171 biomass with a useful biochemical profile for biorefinery process in order to evaluate later  
172 the economic feasibility of CO<sub>2</sub> removal processes [18]. Thus, cellular composition was  
173 determined when cultures reached a steady state (Table 2). All species exhibited high  
174 protein contents, in most cases over 40% of dry biomass. Microalgae showed higher lipid  
175 levels than cyanobacteria, which, in their turn, exhibited higher carbohydrate content than  
176 microalgae. The higher lipid content of microalgae determined the higher calorific values  
177 of microalgae (17-19 kJ g<sup>-1</sup>) compared to cyanobacteria (12-17 kJ g<sup>-1</sup>).



178 Among the two most promising species assayed (*S. vacuolatus* and *N. punctiforme*), the  
179 cyanobacterium presented some advantages such as the ability to grow diazotrophically and  
180 an easier harvest. However, their cultures presented high viscosity (data not shown)  
181 hindering significantly further downstream processes. High viscosity cultures leads to  
182 increase the pumping power requirements and therefore the production costs [37]. Owing to  
183 this and the fact that their cultures presented lower calorific values and a biochemical  
184 profile with lower lipid contents, *N. punctiforme* was discarded for the final selection.

185 *S. vacuolatus* showed better CO<sub>2</sub> fixation than the others species. In addition, its continuous  
186 cultures displayed high cell density in the assayed conditions, 1.88 g L<sup>-1</sup> (result obtained by  
187 dividing biomass productivity by dilution rate) and therefore less volume of culture must be  
188 processed in downstream stages. In addition, its cells settle easily, allowing a faster auto-  
189 flocculation [38]. Furthermore, when considering the possibility of using the generated  
190 biomass for further products, *S. vacuolatus* presented an attractive biomass composition rich  
191 in lipids (≈30%) and proteins (≈45%) (Table 2) that also favored the final selection of this  
192 specie.

193 • **Culture conditions to maximize growth and CO<sub>2</sub> bio-fixation by *S. vacuolatus***

194 To have a better understanding of the ability of *S. vacuolatus* to fix CO<sub>2</sub>, different operating  
195 conditions were established. Hence, tolerance limits to pH, temperature, dilution rate and  
196 light intensity were determined as cornerstones for outdoor cultures. Latter, these results  
197 allowed developing a mathematical model for growth and CO<sub>2</sub> assimilation by this  
198 microalga.

199 The influence of pH (ranging from 6 to 9) on biomass productivity and CO<sub>2</sub> assimilation  
200 was assayed. *S. vacuolatus* presented a wide tolerance to pH variation (Figure 1A). The  
201 statistical analysis (ANOVA,  $p < 0.05$ ) proved an influence of pH on both biomass  
202 productivity and CO<sub>2</sub> fixation rate. Both parameters (biomass productivity and CO<sub>2</sub> fixation  
203 rate) were found to be maximum when pH 7.5, although no statistically significant  
204 difference existed among this value and pH 7.0. When more extreme pH values tested (6.0  
205 and 9.0), biomass productivity and CO<sub>2</sub> fixation rate slightly reduced to 20-25% of the  
206 maximum value obtained when pH was 7.5. Since the dissolved inorganic carbon depends  
207 on different factors such as pH, microalgae have developed different specie-dependent  
208 carbon-uptake mechanisms [39]. Specifically, *Scenedesmus* increases the absorption when  
209 bicarbonate (HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>) is the predominant form of inorganic carbon. The pH tolerance  
210 showed by *S. vacuolatus* was in line with previous results reported for different  
211 *Scenedesmus* species [40].

212 The optimum temperature found for biomass productivity and CO<sub>2</sub> fixation was 30° C  
213 (Figure 1B). When temperature was either 25 or 35° C, 12% reduction in biomass  
214 productivity was displayed. At 40° C, cultures did not achieve a steady state, whereas at  
215 15° C productivity dropped by 63%. The analysis of variance (ANOVA,  $p < 0.05$ ) indicated  
216 a statistically significant influence of temperature on growth and CO<sub>2</sub> assimilation. Likewise  
217 pH, temperature displays and effect on the carbon-uptake mechanisms and therefore on the  
218 growth under phototrophic conditions [39]. Our results agreed with the range of optimal  
219 temperatures (from 10 to 48°C) reported for different *Scenedesmus* species [17, 41-43]. Six  
220 dilution rates, ranging from 0.13 to 0.80 d<sup>-1</sup>, were tested (Figure 1C). The highest values for  
221 CO<sub>2</sub> fixation and biomass productivity were achieved when the dilution rate was 0.6 d<sup>-1</sup>.

222 However, no statistically significant differences were found in the range 0.4 -0.6 d<sup>-1</sup> for  
223 both parameters. At dilution rates lower than 0.4 d<sup>-1</sup> and higher than 0.6 d<sup>-1</sup>, biomass  
224 productivities were reduced by 30%. Analysis of variance proved the relevance of this  
225 variable in culture performance (ANOVA,  $p<0.05$ ). Although it has been reported that  
226 *Scenedesmus* might thrive at dilution rates of even 2 d<sup>-1</sup> [44], it shows better performance at  
227 dilutions in the range of 0.3-0.6 d<sup>-1</sup> in photo-chemostat operations [43] in line with our  
228 results.

229 Three maximum incident PAR irradiance (1000, 2000 and 3000  $\mu\text{E m}^{-2} \text{s}^{-1}$ ) were assayed  
230 (Figure 1D). In all the cases, a steady state was achieved. At high irradiance (3000  $\mu\text{E m}^{-2}$   
231  $\text{s}^{-1}$ ), highest biomass productivity and CO<sub>2</sub> fixation were found (0.63 and 1.15 g L<sup>-1</sup> d<sup>-1</sup>  
232 respectively). When low and mid irradiances (1000 and 2000  $\mu\text{E m}^{-2} \text{s}^{-1}$ ), biomass and CO<sub>2</sub>  
233 fixation dropped by 30% and 15% respectively. Analysis of variance proved the relevance  
234 of this variable in culture rendering (ANOVA,  $p<0.05$ ). The bibliography regarding to light  
235 flux intensity used for *Scenedesmus* cultivations is quite extended and diverse, varying from  
236 60 to 3900  $\mu\text{E m}^{-2} \text{s}^{-1}$  [41, 45]. Similar to our results, *Scenedesmus* species did not show  
237 photo-inhibition despite of the high light flux intensities. Overall, these results indicate that  
238 the optimal growth conditions and thus CO<sub>2</sub> assimilation for *S. vacuolatus* are as follows:  
239 pH, 7.5; maximum PAR light intensity ( $I_{\text{max}}$ ), 3000  $\mu\text{E m}^{-2} \text{s}^{-1}$ ; temperature, 30° C and  
240 dilution rate, 0.4 - 0.6 d<sup>-1</sup>. In these conditions, cultures rendered 0.63 g biomass L<sup>-1</sup> d<sup>-1</sup>,  
241 meaning 1.15 g CO<sub>2</sub> assimilated L<sup>-1</sup> d<sup>-1</sup>.

- 242
- **Modelling growth and CO<sub>2</sub> bio-fixation by *S.vacuolatus***

243 Modelling growth is an interesting tool for the design and operation of an efficient process  
244 for CO<sub>2</sub> removal based on phototrophic microorganisms. A statistical analysis (ANOVA  
245 multifactorial,  $p < 0.05$ ) of the influence of different culture parameters (i.e. pH,  
246 temperature, dilution rate and light intensity) on *S. vacuolatus* growth rate ( $\mu$ ) was  
247 performed. In continuous cultures at steady state, growth rate ( $\mu$ ) equals the dilution rate  
248 (D) [20]. Hence in the proposed model, the dilution rate is identified as the growth rate. The  
249 formulated model (Eq 6) is based on light and temperature, the two most influential  
250 parameters for growth and CO<sub>2</sub> assimilation. The first element of the equation references to  
251 the effect of light on growth rate and it was calculated as average irradiance ( $I_{av}$ ) according  
252 to the mathematical model proposed for light-limited chemostat cultures by Molina-Grima  
253 [36] (Eq 1),  $\mu_{max}$  (d<sup>-1</sup>) as the maximum specific growth rate of *S. vacuolatus* and  $I_k$  (light  
254 saturation constant,  $\mu E m^{-2} s^{-1}$ ) that represents the affinity of this microalga by light and  
255 corresponds to the  $I_{av}$  value where  $\mu = \mu_{max}/2$ . The factor  $n$  is a shape parameter for the  $\mu$ - $I_{av}$   
256 curve and describes the abruptness of the transition from weakly to strongly-illuminated  
257 situations. Our results showed that the growth rate increases hyperbolically along with  $I_{av}$ ,  
258 typical characteristic of photo-limited cultures (Figure 1A, supplementary data).

259 The second element of the model represents the effect of temperature (T) on growth rate.  
260 The Arrhenius equation was used to fit experimental growth data to a temperature-  
261 depending function. Here,  $A_1$  and  $A_2$  are parameters related to the effect of temperature on  
262 the microorganism growth; the first describes the positive effect on growth till 30 °C (as  
263 optimal temperature experimentally determined) and the second defines the negative effect  
264 of higher temperatures on microalgal growth.  $E_{a1}$  and  $E_{a2}$  describe the activation energy for  
265 both parameters,  $A_1$  and  $A_2$ .  $R$  is the universal constant gas used in the Arrhenius equation.

266 Fitting the experimental data to equation 6 by a non-linear regression analysis, the  
 267 following characteristic parameters for *Scenedesmus vacuolatus* cultures were obtained:  
 268  $\mu_{\max} = 0.88 \text{ d}^{-1}$ ;  $n = 2.5$ ;  $I_k = 87.5 \text{ } \mu\text{E m}^{-2} \text{ s}^{-1}$ ,  $A_1 = 2 \cdot 10^7 \text{ d}^{-1}$ ;  $E_{a1} = 4,09 \cdot 10^4 \text{ J mol}^{-1}$ ;  $A_2 =$   
 269  $7,56 \cdot 10^{13} \text{ d}^{-1}$ ;  $E_{a2} = 8,05 \cdot 10^4 \text{ J mol}^{-1}$ ;  $R = 8,31 \text{ J K}^{-1} \text{ mol}^{-1}$ . There was a good adjustment  
 270 between experimental and predicted values for the model proposed ( $R^2 = 0.9$ ) (Figure 1B,  
 271 supplementary data).

$$272 \quad \mu(I_{av}, T) = \left( \frac{\mu_{\max} \times I_{av}^n}{I_k^n + I_{av}^n} \right) \times \left( A_1 \times e^{\left( \frac{E_{a1}}{RT} \right)} - A_2 \times e^{\left( \frac{E_{a2}}{RT} \right)} \right) \quad \text{Eq 6}$$

273 This result indicates that *S. vacuolatus* is a fast growing microorganism with a high  
 274 photosynthetic efficiency ( $I_k < 100 \text{ } \mu\text{E m}^{-2} \text{ s}^{-1}$ ) in comparison to other *Scenedesmus* species  
 275 [43].

276 From equation 6 it is possible to predict the biomass concentration, and therefore biomass  
 277 productivity and CO<sub>2</sub> fixation rate, that a continuous culture can express once a steady state  
 278 is achieved at different light intensity ( $I_{\max}$ ), temperature (T) and dilution rate (as  $\mu(I_{av}, T)$  is  
 279 equal to D in steady state situations). Thus, for every possible combination of these triplet  
 280 of culture variables, it is possible to obtain the theoretical biomass concentration to  
 281 determine then biomass productivity and CO<sub>2</sub> fixation values. The correlation between  
 282 independent process variables ( $I_{\max}$  and T) and biomass productivity and CO<sub>2</sub> fixation rate  
 283 can be visualized by examining the surface plot presented in Figure 2. It clearly shows that  
 284 biomass productivity (A) or CO<sub>2</sub> fixation rate (B) are not linearly increased when the  
 285 process variables do. However, there is an optimal combination of light ( $3000 \text{ } \mu\text{E m}^{-2} \text{ s}^{-1}$ )  
 286 and temperature (30 °C) where biomass productivity and CO<sub>2</sub> fixation rate are maxima. In  
 287 these conditions, the model predicts a biomass productivity of  $0.61 \text{ g L}^{-1} \text{ d}^{-1}$  (Figure 2A)

288 and maximum CO<sub>2</sub> fixation rate of 1.1 g L<sup>-1</sup> d<sup>-1</sup> (Figure 2B) when D = 0.5 d<sup>-1</sup> (D = μ(I<sub>av</sub>, T)  
289 in steady state). These assumptions were validated by experimental data (0.63 g biomass L<sup>-1</sup>  
290 d<sup>-1</sup> and 1.15 g CO<sub>2</sub> assimilated L<sup>-1</sup> d<sup>-1</sup>). Additionally, the model allows the simulation of *S.*  
291 *vacuolatus* cultures in different combination of temperature, irradiance and dilution rate,  
292 predicting outdoor yields. The results achieved in this study are in line with the productivity  
293 data reported in the literature [46], [2] and [47].

294 • **Potential use of *S. vacuolatus* cultures for CO<sub>2</sub> assimilation from flue gases**

295 Finally, the potential of *S. vacuolatus* for biological carbon capture from flue gas emissions  
296 was investigated. For this purpose, photobioreactors were operated at the conditions for  
297 CO<sub>2</sub> assimilation previously established as optimal but initially with no pH- control system.  
298 To determine the optimal ratio of air:flue gas mix, the synthetic mixture of flue gases as  
299 described in material and methods was injected into the airstream either pure (resulting in a  
300 constant supply of 12% CO<sub>2</sub>) or diluted with air (two, four and twelve times, resulting in a  
301 constant supply of 6%, 3% and 1% CO<sub>2</sub> respectively).

302 A steady state was achieved only when the cultures were supplied with the 12 times diluted  
303 flue gas (constant supply of 1% CO<sub>2</sub>). In these conditions, 0.67 g biomass L<sup>-1</sup> d<sup>-1</sup> and 1.22 g  
304 assimilated CO<sub>2</sub> L<sup>-1</sup> d<sup>-1</sup> were obtained respectively (Table 3). Control cultures (i.e. same  
305 culture conditions with a constant supply of 1% pure CO<sub>2</sub>) achieved the same results (Table  
306 3). When the simulated flue gas was not diluted or when it was diluted only two or four  
307 times, pH decreased dramatically and the cultures did not achieve a steady state. Anjo et al,  
308 2013 and Kao et al, 2014 reported similar results for *Chlorella* cultivated using industrial  
309 flue gas.

310 Next, a set of experiments was performed to assess whether it was possible to use non-  
311 diluted flue gas (12% CO<sub>2</sub>) to control the culture pH by flue gas injection on pH-demand.  
312 In this condition, *S. vacuolatus* showed a similar CO<sub>2</sub> fixation rate (1.17 g L<sup>-1</sup> d<sup>-1</sup>)  
313 compared to those observed when a fix amount of 12 times diluted flue gas was supplied or  
314 when pure CO<sub>2</sub> was used for pH control (1.15 g L<sup>-1</sup> d<sup>-1</sup>, this considered as the optimal value  
315 previously determined in this work) (Table 3). The statistical analysis of the data (ANOVA,  
316  $p < 0.05$ ) indicated that there is no significant difference among these results and it is  
317 possible thus to conclude that *S. vacuolatus* exhibits the same biomass productivity  
318 regardless of the source of CO<sub>2</sub> for pH control. The use of flue gases for pH-control was  
319 tested by Lara-Gil et al with *Desmodesmus abundands*, obtaining similar outcomes [48].

320 In addition, when flue gas was used (on demand or diluted twelve times), the biomass  
321 presented the same biochemical composition, mainly rich in proteins and lipids, as the one  
322 obtained when pure CO<sub>2</sub> was used either constantly or on demand (Figure 3). This fact  
323 highlights the potential of this microalga to transform carbon dioxide from flue gases into  
324 valuable biomass and supports its possible use in CO<sub>2</sub> capture systems.

325 **6. CONCLUSIONS**

326 Among eight microalgae and cyanobacteria, *Scenedesmus vacuolatus* was considered the  
327 best candidate for CO<sub>2</sub> mitigation. This microalga showed a high growth rate, ease for  
328 harvesting, high heat value and a biomass composition rich in proteins and lipids.  
329 Moreover, it displayed a good tolerance to variation in pH, temperature and irradiance. The  
330 data were used to develop a model that describes growth and CO<sub>2</sub> bio-fixation, representing  
331 a helpful tool for predicting also the performance of outdoors cultivations. In addition, this  
332 study shows that it is possible to grow *S. vacuolatus* using simulated flue gases from power  
333 plant, rendering a similar CO<sub>2</sub> fixation rate and biochemical composition than using  
334 commercial CO<sub>2</sub>. Our results suggest that *S. vacuolatus* can be considered as a good  
335 candidate for a large-scale biomass production.

Published in Algal Research



## 336 7. ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

337 The authors wish to thank Prof. M. García-Guerrero for his critical reading of the  
338 manuscript and Prof. G. Ación-Fernández for his help in the development of growth  
339 model.

340 This research was supported by the research Project CENIT SOST-CO<sub>2</sub> – New sustainable  
341 industrial uses of CO<sub>2</sub>, with financing by INABENSA S.A.

342

## 343 8. LEGENDS FOR FIGURES

344 **Figure 1.** Influence of pH (A) (Operational conditions: temperature 25 °C; dilution rate  
345 0.4 d<sup>-1</sup> and I<sub>max</sub> 3000 μE m<sup>-2</sup> d<sup>-1</sup>), temperature (B) (Operational conditions: pH 7.5; dilution  
346 rate 0.4 d<sup>-1</sup> and I<sub>max</sub> 3000 μE m<sup>-2</sup> d<sup>-1</sup>), dilution rate (C) (Operational conditions: pH 7.5;  
347 temperature 30 °C and I<sub>max</sub> 3000 μE m<sup>-2</sup> d<sup>-1</sup>) and light intensity (D) (Operational  
348 conditions: pH 7.5; temperature 30 °C and dilution rate 0.5 d<sup>-1</sup>) on biomass productivity  
349 and CO<sub>2</sub> fixation rate in *S. vacuolatus* continuous cultures.

350 **Figure 2.** Response surface of biomass productivity (A) and CO<sub>2</sub> fixation rate (B) by *S.*  
351 *vacuolatus* continuous culture as a function of maximal incident PAR irradiance (I<sub>max</sub>) and  
352 temperature, when dilution rate = 0.5 d<sup>-1</sup>.

353 **Figure 3.** Biochemical composition once a steady state was achieved when *S. vacuolatus*  
354 continuous cultures were aerated with a source of pure CO<sub>2</sub> (on demand or 1%) and flue  
355 gas (on demand or diluted twelve times). Culture conditions operated were those  
356 determined as optimal in this work: D, 0.5 d<sup>-1</sup>; temperature, 30 °C; I<sub>max</sub> 3000 μE m<sup>-2</sup> d<sup>-1</sup>.

357

358 **9. REFERENCES**

- 359 [1] R.K. Pachauri, A. Reisinger, Contribution of Working Groups I, II and III to the Fourth  
360 Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change, IPCC. Geneva,  
361 Switzerland, (2007).
- 362 [2] S.Y. Chiu, C.Y. Kao, C.H. Chen, T.C. Kuan, S.C. Ong, C.S. Lin, Reduction of CO<sub>2</sub> by a high-density  
363 culture of *Chlorella* sp. in a semicontinuous photobioreactor, *Bioresource Technology*, 99 (2008)  
364 3389-3396.
- 365 [3] C.Y. Kao, T.Y. Chen, Y.B. Chang, T.W. Chiu, H.Y. Lin, C.D. Chen, J.S. Chang, C.S. Lin, Utilization of  
366 carbon dioxide in industrial flue gases for the cultivation of microalga *Chlorella* sp, *Bioresource*  
367 *Technology*, 166 (2014) 485-493.
- 368 [4] J.R. Benemann, Utilization of carbon dioxide from fossil fuel-burning power plants with  
369 biological systems, *Energy Conversion and Management*, 34 (1993) 999-1004.
- 370 [5] K. Kumar, D. Banerjee, D. Das, Carbon dioxide sequestration from industrial flue gas by  
371 *Chlorella sorokiniana*, *Bioresource Technology*, 152 (2014) 225-233.
- 372 [6] K. Skjånes, P. Lindblad, J. Muller, BioCO<sub>2</sub> - A multidisciplinary, biological approach using solar  
373 energy to capture CO<sub>2</sub> while producing H<sub>2</sub> and high value products, *Biomolecular Engineering*, 24  
374 (2007) 405-413.
- 375 [7] L.M. Brown, Uptake of carbon dioxide from flue gas by microalgae, *Energy Conversion and*  
376 *Management*, 37 (1996) 1363-1367.
- 377 [8] I. Douskova, J. Doucha, K. Livansky, J. Machat, P. Novak, D. Umysova, V. Zachleder, M. Vitova,  
378 Simultaneous flue gas bioremediation and reduction of microalgal biomass production costs,  
379 *Applied Microbiology and Biotechnology*, (2008) 1-7.
- 380 [9] Y. Chisti, Biodiesel from microalgae, *Biotechnology Advances*, 25 (2007) 294-306.
- 381 [10] O. Pulz, W. Gross, Valuable products from biotechnology of microalgae, *Applied Microbiology*  
382 *and Biotechnology*, 65 (2004) 635-648.
- 383 [11] P. Spolaore, C. Joannis-Cassan, E. Duran, A. Isambert, Commercial applications of microalgae,  
384 *Journal of Bioscience and Bioengineering*, 101 (2006) 87-96.
- 385 [12] L. Brennan, P. Owende, Biofuels from microalgae-A review of technologies for production,  
386 processing, and extractions of biofuels and co-products, *Renewable and Sustainable Energy*  
387 *Reviews*, 14 (2010) 557-577.
- 388 [13] C. Yoo, S.Y. Jun, J.Y. Lee, C.Y. Ahn, H.M. Oh, Selection of microalgae for lipid production under  
389 high levels carbon dioxide, *Bioresource Technology*, (2009).
- 390 [14] C.Y. Chen, K.L. Yeh, H.M. Su, Y.C. Lo, W.M. Chen, J.S. Chang, Strategies to enhance cell growth  
391 and achieve high-level oil production of a *Chlorella vulgaris* isolate, *Biotechnology Progress*, 26  
392 (2010) 679-686.
- 393 [15] M.G. De Morais, J.A.V. Costa, Carbon dioxide fixation by *Chlorella kessleri*, *C. vulgaris*,  
394 *Scenedesmus obliquus* and *Spirulina* sp. cultivated in flasks and vertical tubular photobioreactors,  
395 *Biotechnology Letters*, 29 (2007) 1349-1352.
- 396 [16] M. Ota, H. Watanabe, Y. Kato, M. Watanabe, Y. Sato, R.L. Smith Jr, H. Inomata, Carotenoid  
397 production from *Chlorococcum littorale* in photoautotrophic cultures with downstream  
398 supercritical fluid processing, *Journal of Separation Science*, 32 (2009) 2327-2335.
- 399 [17] M.G. de Morais, J.A.V. Costa, Biofixation of carbon dioxide by *Spirulina* sp. and *Scenedesmus*  
400 *obliquus* cultivated in a three-stage serial tubular photobioreactor, *Journal of Biotechnology*, 129  
401 (2007) 439-445.

402 [18] M. Packer, Algal capture of carbon dioxide; biomass generation as a tool for greenhouse gas  
403 mitigation with reference to New Zealand energy strategy and policy, *Energy Policy*, 37 (2009)  
404 3428-3437.

405 [19] L. Moraes, G.M. da Rosa, B.B. Cardias, L.O. dos Santos, J.A.V. Costa, Microalgal biotechnology  
406 for greenhouse gas control: Carbon dioxide fixation by *Spirulina* sp. at different diffusers, *Ecol.*  
407 *Eng.*, 91 (2016) 426-431.

408 [20] E. Del Río, A. Armendáriz, E. García-Gómez, M. García-González, M.G. Guerrero, Continuous  
409 culture methodology for the screening of microalgae for oil, *Journal of Biotechnology*, 195 (2015)  
410 103-107.

411 [21] B. Wang, Y.Q. Li, N. Wu, C.Q. Lan, CO<sub>2</sub> bio-mitigation using microalgae, *Applied Microbiology*  
412 *and Biotechnology*, 79 (2008) 707-718.

413 [22] P. Fleck-Schneider, F. Lehr, C. Posten, Modelling of growth and product formation of  
414 *Porphyridium purpureum*, *Journal of Biotechnology*, 132 (2007) 134-141.

415 [23] C.J. Hulatt, D.N. Thomas, Energy efficiency of an outdoor microalgal photobioreactor sited at  
416 mid-temperate latitude, *Bioresource Technology*, 102 (2011) 6687-6695.

417 [24] M.A. Vargas, H. Rodríguez, J. Moreno, H. Olivares, J.A. Del Campo, J. Rivas, M.G. Guerrero,  
418 Biochemical composition and fatty acid content of filamentous nitrogen-fixing cyanobacteria,  
419 *Journal of Phycology*, 34 (1998) 812-817.

420 [25] B.K. Nayak, D. Das, Improvement of carbon dioxide biofixation in a photobioreactor using  
421 *Anabaena* sp. PCC 7120, *Process Biochemistry*, 48 (2013) 1126-1132.

422 [26] H. Berberoğlu, N. Barra, L. Pilon, J. Jay, Growth, CO<sub>2</sub> consumption and H<sub>2</sub> production of  
423 *Anabaena variabilis* ATCC 29413-U under different irradiances and CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations, *Journal of*  
424 *Applied Microbiology*, 104 (2008) 105-121.

425 [27] J. Moreno, H. Rodríguez, M.A. Vargas, J. Rivas, M.G. Guerrero, Nitrogen-fixing cyanobacteria  
426 as source of phycobiliprotein pigments. Composition and growth performance of ten filamentous  
427 heterocystous strains, *Journal of Applied Phycology*, 7 (1995) 17-23.

428 [28] A.M. Ruffing, Engineered cyanobacteria: Teaching an old bug new tricks, *Bioengineered Bugs*,  
429 2 (2011) 136-149.

430 [29] D.I. Arnon, B.D. McSwain, H.Y. Tsujimoto, K. Wada, Photochemical activity and components of  
431 membrane preparations from blue-green algae. I. Coexistence of two photosystems in relation to  
432 chlorophyll a and removal of phycocyanin, *BBA - Bioenergetics*, 357 (1974) 231-245.

433 [30] R.R.L. Guillard, J.H. Ryther, Studies of marine planktonic diatoms. I. *Cyclotella nana hustedt*,  
434 and *Detonula confervacea* (Cleve) gran., *Canadian Journal for Microbiology*, 8 (1962) 229-239.

435 [31] R. Rippka, J. Deruelles, J.B. Waterbury, M. Herdman, R.Y. Stanier, Generic assignments, strain  
436 histories and properties of pure cultures of cyanobacteria, *Journal of General Microbiology*, 111  
437 (1979) 1-61.

438 [32] M.E. Clares, J. Moreno, M.G. Guerrero, M. García-González, Assessment of the CO<sub>2</sub> fixation  
439 capacity of *Anabaena* sp. ATCC 33047 outdoor cultures in vertical flat-panel reactors, *Journal of*  
440 *Biotechnology*, 187 (2014) 51-55.

441 [33] O.H. Lowry, N.J. Rosebrough, A.L. Farr, R.J. Randall, Protein measurement with the folin  
442 phenol reagent, *Journal of Biological Chemistry*, 193 (1951) 265-275.

443 [34] G. Kochert, Quantitation of the macromolecular components of microalgae, *Handbook of*  
444 *Phycological Methods. Physiological and Biochemical Methods* (Eds.: J.A Hellebust, J.S. Craigie),  
445 Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, (1978) 189-195.

446 [35] M. Dubois, K.A. Gilles, J.K. Hamilton, P.A. Rebers, F. Smith, Colorimetric method for  
447 determination of sugars and related substances, *Analytical Chemistry*, 28 (1956) 350 - 356.

- 448 [36] E. Molina-Grima, F.G. Camacho, J.A.S. Pérez, J.M.F. Sevilla, F.G.A. Fernández, A.C. Gómez, A  
449 mathematical model of microalgal growth in light-limited chemostat culture, *Journal of Chemical*  
450 *Technology & Biotechnology*, 61 (1994) 167-173.
- 451 [37] A. Wileman, A. Ozkan, H. Berberoglu, Rheological properties of algae slurries for minimizing  
452 harvesting energy requirements in biofuel production, *Bioresource Technology*, 104 (2012) 432-  
453 439.
- 454 [38] M.L. Gerardo, S. Van Den Hende, H. Vervaeren, T. Coward, S.C. Skill, Harvesting of microalgae  
455 within a biorefinery approach: A review of the developments and case studies from pilot-plants,  
456 *Algal Research*, 11 (2015) 248-262.
- 457 [39] G. Markou, D. Vandamme, K. Muylaert, Microalgal and cyanobacterial cultivation: The supply  
458 of nutrients, *Water Research*, 65 (2014) 186-202.
- 459 [40] C. Nalewajko, B. Colman, M. Olaveson, Effects of pH on growth, photosynthesis, respiration,  
460 and copper tolerance of three *Scenedesmus* strains, *Environ. Exp. Bot.*, 37 (1997) 153-160.
- 461 [41] S.P. Singh, P. Singh, Effect of temperature and light on the growth of algae species: A review,  
462 *Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews*, 50 (2015) 431-444.
- 463 [42] T. de Marchin, M. Erpicum, F. Franck, Photosynthesis of *Scenedesmus obliquus* in outdoor  
464 open thin-layer cascade system in high and low CO<sub>2</sub> in Belgium, *Journal of Biotechnology*, 215  
465 (2015) 2-12.
- 466 [43] J.F. Sanchez, J.M. Fernandez-Sevilla, F.G. Acién, M.C. Ceron, J. Perez-Parra, E. Molina Grima,  
467 Biomass and lutein productivity of *Scenedesmus almeriensis* : influence of irradiance, dilution rate  
468 and temperature, *Applied Microbiology and Biotechnology*, 79 (2008) 719-729.
- 469 [44] G. Breuer, D.E. Martens, R.B. Draaisma, R.H. Wijffels, P.P. Lamers, Photosynthetic efficiency  
470 and carbon partitioning in nitrogen-starved *Scenedesmus obliquus*, *Algal Research*, 9 (2015) 254-  
471 262.
- 472 [45] A.P. Koller, H. Löwe, V. Schmid, S. Mundt, D. Weuster-Botz, Model-supported phototrophic  
473 growth studies with *Scenedesmus obtusiusculus* in a flat-plate photobioreactor, *Biotechnology*  
474 *and Bioengineering*, 114 (2017) 308-320.
- 475 [46] K.-D. Sung, J.-S. Lee, C.-S. Shin, S.-C. Park, M.-J. Choi, CO<sub>2</sub> fixation by *Chlorella* sp. KR-1 and its  
476 cultural characteristics, *Bioresource Technology*, 68 (1999) 269-273.
- 477 [47] A. San Pedro, C.V. González-López, F.G. Acién, E. Molina-Grima, Marine microalgae selection  
478 and culture conditions optimization for biodiesel production, *Bioresource Technology*, 134 (2013)  
479 353-361.
- 480 [48] J.A. Lara-Gil, C. Senés-Guerrero, A. Pacheco, Cement flue gas as a potential source of nutrients  
481 during CO<sub>2</sub> mitigation by microalgae, *Algal Research*, 17 (2016) 285-292.

482

483

484